

GCSE SHP History Unit 3D source enquiry: The work of the historian

Guidance document for students

The Unit 3 question paper will be a source based enquiry consisting of six to eight sources and five questions. The questions will usually (but not always) follow the following pattern:

- **Question 1:** Inference.
- **Question 2:** Source analysis e.g. to show its sympathy or purpose etc
- **Question 3:** Cross referencing.
- **Question 4:** Evaluation of utility or reliability
- **Question 5:** following up an enquiry.

You will be tested on a range of different evidence skills, using the sources separately and in combination.

This document is divided into two sections:

- Advice on answering unit 3 questions
- Practice questions and marking exercises

Question 1: Inference

The first question is asking you to make inferences from a source.

The question requires you to:

- make at least two inferences
- use evidence from the source to back up the inference.

What is an inference?

An inference means:

Something you can work out from the source which is not directly said.

For example:

- What is the source suggesting?
- What is its attitude or tone? Is the writer sarcastic, sad, pleased, angry, happy, supportive etc? If it's a visual source, what do the details, expressions etc suggest?
- What evidence in the source supports this attitude, tone, or message?

How to answer inference questions

- Practice by highlighting words or phrases which suggest inferences as you read a source. [If it's a visual source, draw lines out from the details which you can use.]
- Try writing the inference and then support it with a word or phrase from the source.
- Remember you need to make two supported inferences to achieve full marks!

Exam tip: students often fail to make inferences and instead copy out or summarise the source.

The following table will help you to plan your answers:

Inference planning writing grid
I can infer that...
This is supported by...
I can also infer ...
This is supported by...

Developing inference skills

These are some activities which you could carry out in class to develop inference skills:

- **Body language:** work in pairs with one student role playing body language and the other making inferences. For example, a yawn might suggest tiredness or boredom.
- **Bag:** again working in pairs, each student brings in a bag which contains several items about themselves. They have to make inferences from the contents of the bag about each other's interests etc.
- **Matching inferences to sources.** Students are given a set of sources and a list of inferences. They have to match the inferences to the sources.

Question 2: Source Analysis

The second question is asking you to analyse the source. The examiner wants you to work something out about the source from its content. You might be asked to work out its message or purpose, or the attitude of the author. The tables below show you examples of the different question types and what you need to do to answer them.

Question type 1
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Why do you think [this source] was published?• What do you think the author /artist wanted to achieve?• Why was this painting made?
What you need to work out
These questions ask about the purpose of the source - what it was trying to make you think or do or believe.

Question type 2
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• How does the author/artist get his message across?• How has the author/artist shown the importance of ...?• How does the author suggest [something]?
What you need to work out
These questions ask the message - what idea the source was trying to give you and how details of the source have created this message.

Question type 3

- What impression has been created by [this source]?
- What impression was the author/ artist trying to give?

What you need to work out

These questions ask about the **impression** - what idea the source was trying to give you about a person or event. You need to analyse the source details to show this.

Question type 4

- How can you tell that the author / artist was sympathetic to ...?
- How can you tell that the artist author was against?

What you need to work out

This question gives you the author's **attitude** and asks you how you can tell this from the details and message of the source.

All these questions require two things:

- Awareness that the sources were created with a purpose.
- Analysis of the details in the source to show what the author / artist was trying to make you think.

What is meant by the purpose of a source?

This means why was the source produced? What is the source trying to make you think or do?

Think about the different types of source and their possible purpose. Some examples are given below. What others can you add?

Type of source	Possible purpose
Speeches	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Because the speaker wants people to do something.• Because...
Adverts	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Usually intended to persuade people to buy something.• Other purpose...?
Posters	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• For propaganda purposes - to get you to support a certain view.• Other...
Photographs	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• To give you an accurate view of an event.• Other...
Cartoons	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• To make you think about an event by ridicule and exaggeration.• Other...

Developing source analysis skills

These are some activities which you could carry out in class to develop source analysis skills:

- Look at past or present television adverts. They will all be made with the purpose of getting you to buy or do something. Try to identify the message of the advert. How does it try to persuade you?
- Each student could bring in newspaper or magazine adverts. Then, working in pairs, try to identify the way the advert gets across its message.

How to answer source analysis questions

In this type of question you are being asked to:

- Make inferences about the source. For example, what is it suggesting about the person or event? What message is it trying to get across?
- Think about choice and emphasis. What has the source concentrated on - for example has s/he selected mainly good or bad points?
- Think about how the author artist or photographer has created the message or impression. What treatment has s/he given to the details? How has s/he chosen to show them?
- Use evidence from the source to fully explain how you can tell what the author was trying to do or what the author's attitude was. Your answer will be stronger if you use phrases such as

He has chosen he has emphasised ... he has created.

The following tables will help you to plan your answer using the details of the source...

Source analysis planning writing grid: question types 1 & 2

analysing message or purpose
<p>The purpose / message of the source is:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• ...
<p>I can tell this because of details the author has chosen to include</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• ...• ...• ...
<p>This message / purpose is also shown by ...</p> <p>[add in examples of how the source treats the subject. For example these could be 'loaded' words or parts of a visual source designed to make fun of something]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• ...• ...• ...

Source analysis planning writing grid: question type 3

analysing how an impression is created
<p>The impression of the source is:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• ...
<p>This is created by details the author has chosen to include</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• ...• ...• ...
<p>This impression is also created by ...</p> <p>[add in examples of how the source treats the subject. For example these could be 'loaded' words or parts of a visual source designed to make fun of something]</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• ...• ...• ...

Source analysis planning writing grid: question type 4

analysing attitude (sympathy / opposition)

I can tell that the source is [sympathetic to / opposed to] ... because of details the author has chosen to include

- ...
- ...
- ...

The [sympathy / opposition] is also shown by ...

[add in examples of how the source treats the subject. For example these could be 'loaded' words or parts of a visual source designed to make fun of something]

- ...
- ...
- ...

Question 3: Cross referencing

This question is asking you to cross reference three sources.

Cross referencing means comparing what the sources suggest. When cross referencing or comparing sources you should look for:

- Support between the sources - how far do they agree in what they suggest?
- Challenge - how far do they differ in what they suggest?

You also have to think about the reliability of the sources. Here you will use what the caption tells you about the source. This gives you its provenance - it tells you about its origin [who produced it and when]. It may also tell you about its nature [whether it's from a published book or a private letter for example].

- Think about... What extra [or reduced] support or challenge is there because of who produced the source and why (purpose)? For example one source may support or challenge another, but only very weakly because of its reliability.

Developing cross-referencing skills

Try using different coloured highlighter pens to show the support and challenge between the contents of written sources.

For example, highlight in blue in each source areas of support in what the sources are suggesting. Highlight in green areas of challenge between the two sources.

For visual sources try to write around the source what you think it is suggesting. These annotations can also then be highlighted in green or blue.

Similar highlighting can be done by annotating the provenance of the sources and then marking strengths and weaknesses in different colours.

You could then try to complete the tables on pages 16-18, using your highlighting to help you.

Cross referencing question types

The tables below show you examples of the different question types and what you need to do to answer them.

Question type 1
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• How far do the sources suggest that...?• How far do the sources support the view that...?
What you need to do
Use the contents and provenance of the sources to consider amount of support or challenge for the view. Remember there will always be evidence in the sources for and against the view.

Question type 2
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• How far do source C and D support the impression given in source E?• How far do sources C and D support the evidence of source E about ...?
What you need to do
Work out what the impression or key points are in E. Use the contents and provenance of C and D to consider amount of support or challenge for E.

Question type 3

- Do you think we can rely on source E? Explain your answer using sources C, D and E.
- How much of source E is reliable? Explain your answer using sources C, D and E.

What you need to do

Consider the content and provenance of E. Use the contents and provenance of C and D to consider amount of support or challenge for E.

Examiner tip: take care to compare the right three sources. In your examination, the questions can use any of sources A-E

How to answer cross referencing questions

Question types 1 and 2

How to answer

To achieve Level 2 you are being asked to identify:

- Support / challenge between the contents of the sources for the view or Source E.

Or

- How the reliability of the sources affects support for the view or Source E.

NB You need to refer to all three sources to achieve a high mark within Level 2.

To achieve Level 3 you are being asked to:

- Think about how the reliability of the sources affects the strength of support or challenge for the view / impression / source.
- Make judgements on the extent of support or challenge. Use judgement words or phrases such as strong support, some support, little support, no support.

Use the following tables to help plan your answer.

Question type 1

Eg How far do the sources support the view that...?

Source C	Support for the view	Challenge for the view	Extent of support	Overall conclusion
Contents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ... • ... [if none write none]	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ... • ... [if none write none]		
Provenance				

Source D	Support for the view	Challenge for the view	Extent of support	Overall conclusion
Contents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ... • ... [if none write none]	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ... • ... [if none write none]		
Provenance				

Source E	Support for the view	Challenge for the view	Extent of support	Overall conclusion
Contents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ... • ... [if none write none]	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ... • ... [if none write none]		
Provenance				

Question type 2

Eg How far do sources C and D support the evidence of source E about ...?

Examiner tip: always do this source first in type 2 questions.		
Source E	Impression or view or claim given in source E	What you need to do
Contents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ... • ... 	Show what claim the source is making - using the skills of source analysis you used also in question 2. It is this claim or impression you will be testing, using sources C and D
Provenance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ... • ... 	Think about how reliable the evidence of source E is using its own nature origin and / or purpose

Source C	Support for Source E	Challenge for Source E	Extent of support	Overall conclusion
Contents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ... • ... [if none write none]	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ... • ... [if none write none]		
Provenance				

Source D	Support for Source E	Challenge for Source E	Extent of support	Overall conclusion
Contents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ... • ... [if none write none]	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ... • ... [if none write none]		
Provenance				

Question type 3

Eg Do you think we can rely on source E? Explain your answer using sources C, D and E.

Examiner tip: always do this source first in type 3 questions.		
Source E	Impression or view or claim given in source E	What you need to do
Contents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ... • ... 	Show what claim the source is making - using the skills of source analysis you used also in question 2. It is this claim or impression you will be testing, using sources C and D
Provenance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ... • ... 	Think about how reliable the evidence of source E is using its own nature origin and / or purpose

Source C	Support for Source E	Challenge for Source E	Extent of support	Overall conclusion
Contents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ... • ... [if none write none]	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ... • ... [if none write none]		
Provenance				

Source D	Support for Source E	Challenge for Source E	Extent of support	Overall conclusion
Contents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ... • ... [if none write none]	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ... • ... [if none write none]		
Provenance				

Question 4: Evaluation of sources

This question is asking you to evaluate either the utility or the value of two sources.

What is meant by utility and value?

- Utility - this is asking whether the source is useful - what it can contribute to your enquiry.
- Value - this is also asking what the source can contribute. You can answer both questions in the same way. The word 'value' is often used when one of the sources doesn't have very much information in it, but is valuable in other ways. For example, a cartoon might not contain much factual information but might be valuable for allowing you to see ideas about an issue or attitudes to it.

Reliability can be brought into your evaluation of usefulness or value. The reliability of a source is important in making a judgement.

These are three ways in which the utility/value question could be phrased:

Study Sources F and G.

Which of sources F and G is more useful [or valuable] to an historian enquiring? Explain your answer, using Sources F and G.

Study Sources F and G.

Is Source F more useful [or valuable] than source G to an historian enquiring? Explain your answer using sources F and G.

Study Sources F and G.

Compare the value of Sources F and G for an historian enquiring into Explain your answer, using Sources F and G.

How to answer source evaluation questions

- You can reach level 2 by explaining the usefulness / value of the contents of each of the sources.
- You can also reach level 2 by explaining the value and/or limitations of the nature, origins or purpose - of the sources.
- To achieve level 3 you need to **evaluate** the contents and N/O/P for both sources. You must think about the N/O/P affects the value of the content.
- Try to begin each paragraph with the words of the question e.g. Source F is more useful because... or Source G is less valuable because. [You can also decide that they are equally useful / valuable. Your marks come from your evaluation of the sources.]
- You must evaluate both sources. It is easier to do each source in turn.

Use the following tables to help you plan your answer ...

Source . . .		
<u>N</u>ature What type of source is it?	<u>O</u>rigin Who produced it? When? Where?	<u>P</u>urpose Why was it produced?

Utility Planning Sheet		
	Source F	Source G
<p>Usefulness of what the source suggests.</p> <p>Give examples of what the source is useful for.</p>		
<p>Limitations or strengths of each source compared to the other</p> <p>Identify aspects of topic we cannot find from one source which we can from the other.</p>		
<p>Value of N/O/P of source.</p> <p>What affects its usefulness / value compared to the other source - for example how reliable is it? Has the author special knowledge etc.</p>		

Developing Source evaluation skills

These are some activities which you can use in class to develop your evaluation skills:

Look at a variety of sources and annotate them with the 5 Ws...

- What type of source is it - nature
- Who produced it - origins
- When was it produced- origins
- Where was it produced - origins
- Why was it produced - purpose

Think about the different types of source and how that may affect their possible value. BUT always think about whether these things are correct for the actual source you are using in the paper...

Type of source	Nature (some possible points to make)
Diaries	Give a day to day eyewitness view but only one view and if to be published can have an ulterior motive.
Memoirs	Views of someone who experienced the event and enable person to be detached and reflect on the event. But may be coloured by hindsight. [Note: Be careful about generalised statements about memory loss. If important event unlikely to have been forgotten.]
Posters	Reflect view of the time, often of the government but may be one-sided and generally for propaganda purposes.
Photographs	Can give accurate details. However might be selective and taken for a purpose. Can give a distorted view.
Cartoons	Can reflect a popular view of the time of a person or event - an 'in joke'. However, may be an exaggerated even distorted view of the event.
Biography	Often well researched. However biographer often strongly in favour of or against the subject of the biography.

Origins	
Who produced the source?	Is there the name of an individual or an organisation? What are you told about who produced the source? Is the person in a position to be particularly knowledgeable?
When?	Was the source produced by someone who was there at the time, or was it produced later? What are the advantages and disadvantages of eyewitness accounts? Remember eyewitnesses can get things wrong or get a limited view. Try to avoid generalised statements such as 'Eyewitness accounts are always more useful/reliable than those written later' Someone writing later could have more opportunity to check out the facts.
Where? Under what circumstances	Was the source produced in a context in which the person could give their own views? Was the person forced to follow the government view? For example many First and Second World War sources were produced under strict government censorship. They are still useful as an example of a censored view of the time.

Type of source	Possible purpose
Speeches	Because the speaker wants people to do something.
Adverts	Usually intended to persuade people to buy something.
Posters	For propaganda purposes - to get you to support a certain view or turn you against the other side.
Photographs	To give a particular view of an event. Purpose may be to give an accurate record. But it could also be to give a narrow or particularly dramatic and even distorted view of an event. Purpose may be to inform or to impress or possibly to get your support or turn you against an event.
Cartoons	To turn you against a person or event by ridicule and exaggeration, or to persuade you to support an idea or campaign.

Exam tips:

Try to avoid generalised statements such as 'The camera never lies' and 'all cartoons exaggerate'.

Use evidence from the source(s) to back up your comments on nature, origins or purpose.

You do not have to make developed comments on all three - nature, origins and purpose - of each source. Make sure you have addressed some aspect on each source.

Question 5: The enquiry question

This is the last question in Unit 3 D and it is asking you to think about how to follow up an enquiry. You will be given a statement from a secondary source, and be expected to use your knowledge of the work of the historian to explain the difficulties of finding proof of the statement. You will also be asked to explain how the statement could be checked, using other sources.

Each of the source types in your paper is an example you can give. Think also of other sources from the period of the paper - and how you could use them. Be careful not to suggest sources which didn't exist. Remember, no TV before the mid twentieth century! Always make your answer relevant to the enquiry question.

How to answer the enquiry question

Let's take an example...

Source H: From the Burston School Strike by Bertram Edwards, published in 1971. He is writing about an event in the early twentieth century

It does seem beyond doubt that Mr and Mrs Higdon were great figures in the local community and of great value. The Norfolk Education Committee did not appreciate their quality as teachers. The dismissal of the Higdons over a squabble with a few School Managers was wrong.

Source H suggests that the Higdons were good teachers. Explain the difficulties in finding proof of this and suggest other research the historian could do to check how good the Higdons were as teachers.

Firstly the difficulties...

1. Think about the problems of answering this sort of question.

For example: How might you answer it about teachers today? What is a good teacher? A teacher might be good with pupils, but not follow the things a head teacher wanted in the school. For example, the teacher might not enforce school uniform.

What might be the difficulties in reaching a judgment? For example might one difficulty be that your sources might disagree?

2. Then think about the problems of getting evidence to answer the question for the period in question. Remember, for the best marks, you will need to link the problems of evidence directly to the enquiry. In this case some of the difficulties come from the time which has passed - you won't be able to interview pupils or school managers - but the difficulties also come from the problems of deciding what makes a teacher 'good'.

Now the enquiry...

1. Identify two or three sub-questions which will help you answer your main question.
2. Explain how they will answer the main question.
3. Identify types of sources which will help you answer each sub-question.
4. Explain what evidence they will give you and how that will help answer the question.

Use the following table to help

sub question	Explanation (how will it help answer the main question)	Possible source types from examples in the paper and how they will help	Possible source types from my own knowledge and how they will help
First sub question		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Source... • Useful because... 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Source • Useful because
Second sub question			
Third sub question			

