

Mark Scheme (Results)

Summer 2012

GCSE History B (5HB03/3A)

Unit 3: Schools History Project

Source Enquiry

Option 3A: The transformation of  
surgery, c1845-c1918

## **Edexcel and BTEC Qualifications**

Edexcel and BTEC qualifications come from Pearson, the world's leading learning company. We provide a wide range of qualifications including academic, vocational, occupational and specific programmes for employers. For further information, please visit our website at [www.edexcel.com](http://www.edexcel.com).

Our website subject pages hold useful resources, support material and live feeds from our subject advisors giving you access to a portal of information. If you have any subject specific questions about this specification that require the help of a subject specialist, you may find our Ask The Expert email service helpful.

[www.edexcel.com/contactus](http://www.edexcel.com/contactus)

## **Pearson: helping people progress, everywhere**

Our aim is to help everyone progress in their lives through education. We believe in every kind of learning, for all kinds of people, wherever they are in the world. We've been involved in education for over 150 years, and by working across 70 countries, in 100 languages, we have built an international reputation for our commitment to high standards and raising achievement through innovation in education. Find out more about how we can help you and your students at: [www.pearson.com/uk](http://www.pearson.com/uk)

Summer 2012

Publications Code UG032480

All the material in this publication is copyright

© Pearson Education Ltd 2012

## General Marking Guidance

- All candidates must receive the same treatment. Examiners must mark the first candidate in exactly the same way as they mark the last.
- Mark schemes should be applied positively. Candidates must be rewarded for what they have shown they can do rather than penalised for omissions.
- Examiners should mark according to the mark scheme not according to their perception of where the grade boundaries may lie.
- There is no ceiling on achievement. All marks on the mark scheme should be used appropriately.
- All the marks on the mark scheme are designed to be awarded. Examiners should always award full marks if deserved, i.e. if the answer matches the mark scheme. Examiners should also be prepared to award zero marks if the candidate's response is not worthy of credit according to the mark scheme.
- Where some judgement is required, mark schemes will provide the principles by which marks will be awarded and exemplification may be limited.
- When examiners are in doubt regarding the application of the mark scheme to a candidate's response, the team leader must be consulted.
- Crossed out work should be marked UNLESS the candidate has replaced it with an alternative response.

### Placing a mark within a level mark band

- The instructions below tell you how to reward responses within a level. Follow these unless there is an instruction given within a level. However, where a level has specific guidance about how to place an answer within a level, **always** follow that guidance.
- **2 mark bands**  
Start with the presumption that the mark will be the higher of the two.  
An answer which is poorly supported gets the lower mark.
- **3 mark bands**  
Start with a presumption that the mark will be the middle of the three.  
An answer which is poorly supported gets the lower mark.  
An answer which is well supported gets the higher mark.
- **4 mark bands**  
Start with a presumption that the mark will be the upper middle mark of the four.  
An answer which is poorly supported gets a lower mark.  
An answer which is well supported and shows depth or breadth of coverage gets the higher mark.

- Mark schemes will indicate within the table where, and which strands of QWC, are being assessed. The strands are as follows:
  - i) ensure that text is legible and that spelling, punctuation and grammar are accurate so that meaning is clear*
  - ii) select and use a form and style of writing appropriate to purpose and to complex subject matter*
  - iii) organise information clearly and coherently, using specialist vocabulary when appropriate.*

## Unit 3: Schools History Project Source Enquiry

### Option 3A: The transformation of surgery, c1845-c1918

Question Number		
<b>1</b>		What can you learn from Source A about surgery before Lister?  Target: Source comprehension: inference (AO3a)
Level	Mark	Descriptor
	<b>0</b>	No rewardable material
<b>1</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>Comprehension</b>  Response selects relevant detail(s) from source.  <i>e.g. patients died after operations using anaesthetics.</i>
<b>2</b>	<b>2-3</b>	<b>Unsupported inference.</b>  Valid inference(s) are offered, but without support from source.  <i>e.g. Operations were done without any effective means of fighting infection; Improvements had been made but surgery was still very dangerous; anaesthetics didn't improve the death rate from operations</i>
<b>3</b>	<b>4-6</b>	<b>Supported inference.</b>  Valid inference(s) are made and supported from the source.  <i>e.g. Operations were frightening and risky as many did not survive them; It was much safer to be operated outside of hospitals because they were an area with high risks of infection before the development of antiseptics;</i>  <i>Where they were done was also liable to determine the extent of risk, highest in hospitals rather than in doctors' surgeries.</i>  One well developed point may score a maximum of 5.

Question Number		
2		<p>Why was this illustration included in this book on surgery? Explain your answer, using Source B.</p> <p>Target: Analysis of source for purpose (AO3a)</p>
Level	Mark	Descriptor
	0	No rewardable material
1	1-2	<p><b>Simple statement without support</b></p> <p>Valid comment is offered about why the illustration was included in the book but without support from the source.</p> <p><i>e.g. They wanted to show how operations were done</i></p> <p>Answer identifies detail(s) or information from source, but relevance to show purpose is not explained.</p> <p><i>e.g. the drawing shows four men operating on a patient and an antiseptic spray is being used.</i></p>
2	3-5	<p><b>Supported statement</b></p> <p>Valid comment about why the illustration was included and is linked to content or nature of the source.</p> <p><i>e.g. the drawing shows that the surgeons are taking proper care of the patients and are careful; the drawing is designed to show how operations should be done correctly, using a carbolic spray.</i></p>
3	6-8	<p><b>Explained message</b></p> <p>Analysis of the treatment or selection of the source content is used to explain purpose.</p> <p><i>e.g. the drawing is designed to encourage others to use the new methods being used; The operation is using the new techniques which must have been important as a drawing of them has been made.</i></p>

Question Number		
<b>3</b>		How far do Sources B and C suggest that Pasteur's advice in Source D was followed? Explain your answer, using these sources.  Target: Cross referencing for support (AO3a)
Level	Mark	Descriptor
	<b>0</b>	No rewardable material
<b>1</b>	<b>1-2</b>	<p><b>Generalised answer</b></p> <p>Offers valid undeveloped comment, without support from sources</p> <p><i>e.g. Many surgeons did not use antiseptic surgery; some doctors were prepared to use new ideas.</i></p> <p>OR</p> <p>Selects details from the sources, but without linkage to the question focus.</p> <p><i>e.g. B shows that some operations used an antiseptic spray; source C shows no awareness of cause of infection.</i></p>
<b>2</b>	<b>3-6</b>	<p><b>Supported answer</b></p> <p>Identifies elements of support and/or challenge based on matching details of source (s) content.</p> <p><i>e.g. C shows poor methods but so does Source B which shows surgeons wearing ordinary clothes; C only shows poor methods but this is not the case with D which shows awareness of the danger of germs.</i></p> <p>OR</p> <p>Concept of support/challenge is approached as a reliability issue and comments are offered based on the nature of the source(s).</p> <p><i>e.g. C is from one of Lister's assistants so he is critical of the old methods. The illustration in B shows an operation using antiseptic methods but it might be exaggerated for effect.</i></p> <p>Reserve top level for answers which make use of all three sources.</p>

3	7-10	<p><b>Balanced Judgement</b></p> <p>The overall hypothesis that surgical methods were changing is recognised in source B but C shows that old methods were still used.</p> <p>EITHER</p> <p>Cross referencing focuses on content: considers elements of both support and challenge to arrive at an overall judgement on the extent of support.</p> <p><i>e.g. All 3 sources show awareness of the dangers of infection but only B shows that Pasteur's views had influenced surgical practice.</i></p> <p>OR</p> <p>Cross referencing focuses on source: considers the nature of the sources B, C and D in order to judge the strength/quality of support/challenge provided by the content.</p> <p><i>e.g. C is from a an assistant of Lister so he would be biased against the old way of doing things: B suggests the adoption of new methods such as the antiseptic spray but only one example it may not have been typical: D is part of a lecture designed to encourage surgeons to use the new methods based on science so should be OK..</i></p> <p>Reserve top level (10) for those able to combine both these elements of extent and nature of support in coming to an overall judgement.</p>
---	------	---

Question Number		
4		Which of Sources E or F is more useful to the historian enquiring into the importance of Lister to the development of surgery? Explain your answer, using Sources E and F.  Target: Evaluation of utility (AO3a)
Level	Mark	Descriptor
	0	No rewardable material
1	1-3	<p><b>Judgement based on simple valid criteria.</b></p> <p>Comments based on amount of detail, or assumed reliability because F is from a modern book on microbes or E is an article in The Times.</p> <p><i>e.g. Source F tells us about Lister's importance and is from a book about the history of this topic; Source E was written soon after his death.</i></p> <p>Maximum 2 marks for one source only.</p>
2	4-7	<p><b>Judgement is based on the usefulness of the sources' information</b></p> <p>Answer focuses on what the sources can or cannot tell us.</p> <p><i>e.g. Source E tells us that surgeons disagreed over Lister's methods and not all were interested in using them.</i></p> <p><i>F gives reasons why his work was important in defeating infection.</i></p> <p>OR</p> <p><b>Judgement is based on evaluation of nature or authorship of sources.</b></p> <p>Answer focuses on how reliable/how representative/authoritative the source is.</p> <p><i>e.g. Source E us from a newspaper shortly after Lister's death and is justifying the opposition; Source F is from a book which is focused on this topic and should have been well researched.</i></p> <p>Maximum 5 marks if L2 criteria are met for only one source.</p>

3	8-10	<p><b>Judgement combines both elements of L2 to assess the contribution the sources can make to the specific enquiry.</b></p> <p>Answer considers the value of information, taking into account an aspect of its nature (i.e. how representative /authoritative /comprehensive it is.)</p> <p><i>e.g. Source E provides a balanced and possibly less one sided view of Lister's importance and how his methods encountered resistance; It is from a newspaper soon after Lister's death which was reviewing his importance; Source F is also balanced giving reasons why Lister's work was important and is written in 1974 with hindsight.</i></p> <p>Maximum 9 marks if level 3 criteria are met for one source only or if content and reliability are not integrated.</p>
---	------	--

Question Number		
<b>*5</b>		<p>'Resistance to change was the main reason for opposition to Lister's ideas'.</p> <p>How far do you agree with this statement? Use your own knowledge, Sources C, E and G and any other sources you find helpful to explain your answer.</p> <p>Target Reaching a judgement (AO1 &amp; 2: 8; AO3a: 8)  <b>QWC Strands i ii iii</b>  Assessing QWC: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>For the highest mark in a level <b>all</b> criteria for the level, including those for QWC must be met.</li> </ul> </p>
Level	Mark	Descriptor
	<b>0</b>	No rewardable material
<b>1</b>	<b>1-4</b>	<p><b>Generalised answer</b></p> <p>Answer offers valid undeveloped comment without direct support from sources or own knowledge.</p> <p><i>e.g. Agrees that the new ideas took time to be widely adopted because of resistance.</i></p> <p>OR</p> <p>Selects details from the sources, but without direct linkage to the question.</p> <p><i>e.g. C shows the use of old methods; E shows that surgeons had good results without using carbolic acid.</i></p> <p>Writing communicates ideas using everyday language and showing some selection of material, but the response lacks clarity and organisation. The student spells, punctuates and uses the rules of grammar with limited accuracy.</p> <p>1 mark for each separate point offered.</p>
<b>QWC i-ii-iii</b>		
<b>2</b>	<b>5-8</b>	<p><b>Supported answer</b></p> <p>Answer offers a judgment on the hypothesis and links to relevant details from sources and/or own knowledge.</p> <p><i>e.g. E shows that there were reasons why older methods were still being used regardless of Lister's work;; G indicates that they concentrated on increasing speed and E shows that in the 1870s Lister's methods were not perfected at outset.</i></p> <p>Writing communicates ideas using a limited range of historical terminology and showing some skills of selection and organisation of material, but passages lack clarity and organisation. The student spells, punctuates and uses some of the rules of grammar with general accuracy.</p>
<b>QWC i-ii-iii</b>		

<p style="text-align: center;"><b>3</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>QWC i-ii-iii</b></p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>9-12</b></p>	<p><b>Response focuses on issue and considers resistance to change/other factors that explain why Lister's work took time to be widely accepted.</b></p> <p>Answer offers reasons to explain why Lister's methods were not quickly developed and taken up by surgeons.</p> <p><i>e.g. G shows that surgeons were preoccupied with speed rather than antiseptis; E that Lister's methods had initial weaknesses and shows scepticism about the methods he used.</i></p> <p><i>There was a lack of knowledge and weak data at first. C indicates that old methods continued without change after Lister had made his work known</i></p> <p>Writing communicates ideas using historical terms accurately and showing some direction and control in the organising of material. The student uses some of the rules of grammar appropriately and spells and punctuates with considerable accuracy, although some spelling errors may still be found.</p> <p>At this level the answer will be unbalanced and only points of agreement or disagreement will be convincingly explored.</p> <p>Reserve 11-12 marks for answers which use sources and own knowledge.</p> <p><b>NB No access to this level for responses which do not use the sources.</b></p>
<p style="text-align: center;"><b>4</b></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>QWC i-ii-iii</b></p>	<p style="text-align: center;"><b>13-16</b></p>	<p><b>Sustained argument, exploring the evidence for and against the hypothesis.</b></p> <p>Answer considers the significance of Lister's work but can place in context. Appreciates that initially there were valid reasons other than resistance to change why surgeons took time to be convinced of the value of antiseptis. Own knowledge and material from the sources is precisely selected to support the points made.</p> <p><i>e.g. Weighs the effectiveness of use against the reasons why people were not immediately impressed by the significance of the breakthrough Lister had made. The latter was often a result of lack of knowledge of the causes of disease. Also Lister's work had flaws and his own approach often caused opposition to his methods</i></p> <p>Writing communicates ideas effectively, using a range of precisely selected historical terms and organising information clearly and coherently. The student spells, punctuates and uses the rules of grammar with considerable accuracy, although some spelling errors may still be found</p> <p>Reserve 15-16 for those responses which also take into account the strength of the evidence from the provided sources when coming to an overall conclusion.</p>

		<b>NB No access to this level for responses which do not include additional recalled knowledge.</b>
--	--	---

Further copies of this publication are available from  
Edexcel Publications, Adamsway, Mansfield, Notts, NG18 4FN

Telephone 01623 467467

Fax 01623 450481

Email [publication.orders@edexcel.com](mailto:publication.orders@edexcel.com)

Order Code UG032480 Summer 2012

For more information on Edexcel qualifications, please visit our website  
[www.edexcel.com](http://www.edexcel.com)

Pearson Education Limited. Registered company number 872828  
with its registered office at Edinburgh Gate, Harlow, Essex CM20 2JE

Ofqual



Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru  
Welsh Assembly Government

